

From: [Simpson-Alisca, Karen](#)
To: [Craig Kutil](#)
Subject: RE: AD-T Major Requirements Course Substitutions
Date: Monday, November 25, 2019 8:06:30 PM

Hi Craig, below are my responses to your questions. Please forgive any typographical or grammar errors. I find difficult to write such lengthy emails from my MS Surface laptop due to its small screen. Please let me know if you need any further clarifications. Karen

- 1) Do you agree with the following statement: "Associate Degrees for Transfer (AD-T's) are local degrees in regards to Community Colleges?"

Because the community colleges have a long standing history of using the term 'local associate degree' for their long existed AA and AS degrees, it's advisable not to use the term 'local' when referencing the Associate Degree for AA-T and AS-T degrees.

The 'AA-T and AS-T' degrees created by the community colleges in response to the STAR Act (aka SB 1440 or Associate Degree for Transfer or AA-T/AS-T) are not considered to be local degrees. While they are developed by each community college using their own courses, the degrees are designed using the various intersegmentally developed 'Transfer Model Curriculum' (TMC) templates, as California Code of Regulations (CCR).

"California Education Code - EDC § 66746 (B) A minimum of 18 semester units or 27 quarter units in a major or area of emphasis, as determined by the community college district and meeting the requirements of an approved transfer model curriculum."

Each of the community colleges' courses that are used in the major core of their TMC developed Associate Degree for Transfer (AA-T or AS-T) must meet the criteria as described in the intersegmentally developed course descriptor. The CCC courses used in the AA-T or AS-T degree must be submitted to the C-ID project for intersegmental faculty review. If approved the course used in the AA/AS-T degree's major core is given a C-ID identifier.

Additionally, students who have earned an Associate Degree for Transfer (AA-T or AS-T) must meet the CSU minimum admission requirement. The STAR Act does not set aside the CSU's minimum admission requirement as stated in the California Code of Regulations (CCR), [§ 40803](#) and [§ 40803.1](#) which specifically states the requirements commonly referred to as the Golden four are required for all transfer admission applicants. Due to confusions in the field based on the use of IGETC within the ADT degrees, the CCCCO provided clarification to colleges by issuing [AA18-10_Associate Degree for Transfer Advisory](#)

- 2) Do you agree with the following statements: "There is no repercussion for transfer students for substitutions for major requirement courses, regarding AD-T's, approved by a Community College regardless of what was substituted," and "CSU's do not care about what Community Colleges do in regards to course substitutions for major requirements regarding

AD'Ts."

The overall legislative intent of the STAR Act was to provide community college students with transfer major pathways that provide clear guidance of courses required to complete their degree within 120 semester units. Additionally the STAR Act provides students a major course pattern that allows a student to transfer to any CSU campus that has deemed the related Transfer Model Curriculum (TMC) similar to their major and concentrations.

The systemwide portability of these degrees is based on the uniformity of the AA-T and AS-T degrees based on the use of the TMC templates. The TMC templates and then related C-ID process are an important part of the success of the Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT) program. The CSU campuses rely on the uniformity of the AA-T and AS-T degrees and their compliance to the TMCs to map the remaining 60 semester (90 quarter) units for the transfer student as per the STAR Act.

A community college awarding an 'Associate Degree for Transfer' that does not fall within the agreement between the two segment senates, such as, awarding an AA-T or AS-T degree with improper course substitutions, is disingenuous to those students who have elected to take this pathway.

1. Students who are awarded an AA/AS-T degree that was not in compliance with the TMC would be required to complete any missing lower-division coursework that are part of the 18 unit major core requirement which is necessary for successful completion of upper-division requirements.
2. If the CSU campus determines that they are unable to fit the missing course or courses that were part of the 18 unit AA/AS-T major core requirements in the remaining 60 units of upper-division, the student would be deemed non-ADT and be held to all upper-division transfer requirements.

Additionally, if it is recognized by the campus that the use of improper course substitutions is a common practice by the community college, the CSU campus is encouraged to contact the college to bring this issue to their attention. If the improper course substitution or other related issues continue, the campus can seek assistance from the CSUCO. The CSUCO will seek guidance from the CCC Chancellor's Office and/or working with the ASCSU to seek guidance and assistance from ASCCC to work with the college or district to align their policies to conform with the agreed ADT standards.

- 3) Would a student ever be required to take classes outside of the 60 units required at the CSU if a substitution occurred that did not comply with the requirements of the Transfer Model Curriculum (TMC) for an AD-T?

Yes, see response above.

- 4) Does the CSU's system believe it is okay to pass-along courses from our own campus regarding major requirements for AD-T's?

Using courses that have not been approved by C-ID under the guise of 'pass-along' within

the AA-T or AS-T degree is completely contrary to what was agreed to by the two segments senates at the SB 1440 Implementation and Oversight Committee (IOC). Furthermore, the use of your own courses does not conform to the established definition of 'pass-along'.

The use of your own courses as substitutions within an ADT defeats the entire purpose of the C-ID process.

Specifically courses that have been denied approval for C-ID when approval is required on the TMC? Courses that cannot be approved for, do not match, the C-ID descriptor (example: Calculus 1 cannot be approved for the Business Calculus C-ID course descriptor)?

The established procedures of using the C-ID process is based on years of intersegmental collaboration between the two segment faculties that resulted in the development of, and confidence in the TMC and course descriptor concept. As agreed by the two segment senates, the TMC and course descriptors replace the traditional institution-to-institution, course-to-course articulation process.

Therefore, a colleges intentional use of courses that do not match the TMC required course or have been denied approval for C-ID are outside of the intersegmental agreement between the two senates and is out of compliance of the CCC Chancellor's Office policy for approval of the Associate Degree for Transfer as stated in the PACAH section 3, page 88, § II, A.

"Constituent courses must have either C-ID or articulation/transfer status with CSU as specified on the TMC and the Chancellor's Office Template."

What about courses that cannot be a part of an Articulation Agreement by Major (AAM) as required by the TMC (example: Intercollege Athletics courses for Physical Activity courses in regards to AAM)?

As stated above those courses are out of compliance. As determined by the CSU campus as to the potential impact of the campuses ability to map the remaining 60 semester units, the CSU campus can deem the student to be non-ADT. Additionally, the campus is encouraged to share this information with the CSUCO so that it can be properly reported to the CCC Chancellor's Office.

- 5) Is there any concern within the CSU system regarding the integrity of the AD-T program in general and course substitutions specifically?
Yes, in fact, our campuses have noted occasions in which ADT degrees were awarded not meeting the standards established. We are tracking these activities which we'll use as examples for an upcoming meeting between the two segment system offices.
- 6) Could a Community College campus ever be contacted by the CSU Chancellor's Office, or would your office ever contact the California Community Colleges Chancellor Office, raising concerns about a Community College that are not following the TMC's, and could this have

an impact on the Community College?

Yes, in response to concerns raised by our campuses, we have advised campuses to first reach out to the community college to alert them to the error noted in the degree. It is not uncommon that such an error can be made by a new staff without knowledge of the policies related to these degrees. However if there are no patterns of correction noted after conversations between the two institutions, we encouraged our campuses to share this information with the CSUCO so that it can be properly reported to the CCC Chancellor's Office with a request for their assistance.

From: Craig Kutil <CKutil@laspositascollege.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, November 19, 2019 2:39 PM
To: Simpson-Alisca, Karen <ksimpson-alisca@calstate.edu>
Subject: AD-T Major Requirements Course Substitutions

[Caution - External Sender]

Hello Karen,

Thank you for taking time to speak with me today about course substitutions for major requirements for AD-T's. As we agreed, I am emailing you with specific questions that I am grateful you are willing to address:

- 1) Do you agree with the following statement: "Associate Degrees for Transfer (AD-T's) are local degrees in regards to Community Colleges."
- 2) Do you agree with the following statements: "There is no repercussion for transfer students for substitutions for major requirement courses, regarding AD-T's, approved by a Community College regardless of what was substituted," and "CSU's do not care about what Community Colleges do in regards to course substitutions for major requirements regarding AD'Ts."
- 3) Would a student ever be required to take classes outside of the 60 units required at the CSU if a substitution occurred that did not comply with the requirements of the Transfer Model Curriculum (TMC) for an AD-T?
- 4) Does the CSU's system believe it is okay to pass-along courses from our own campus regarding major requirements for AD-T's? Specifically courses that have been denied approval for C-ID when approval is required on the TMC? Courses that cannot be approved for, do not match, the C-ID descriptor (example: Calculus 1 cannot be approved for the Business Calculus C-ID course descriptor)? What about courses that cannot be a part of an Articulation Agreement by Major (AAM) as required by the TMC (example: Intercollege Athletics courses for Physical Activity courses in regards to AAM)?
- 5) Is there any concern within the CSU system regarding the integrity of the AD-T program in general and course substitutions specifically?
- 6) Could a Community College campus ever be contacted by the CSU Chancellor's Office, or would your office ever contact the California Community Colleges Chancellor Office, raising concerns about a Community College that are not following the TMC's, and could this have

an impact on the Community College?

If there is anything else you would like to say, I am more than happy to hear from you.

Thank you and take care,

Craig Kutil

Articulation Officer

Chair, Curriculum Committee

Professor, Mathematics

Instructor, Martial Arts

Las Positas College

(925) 424-1346

<http://laspositascollege.edu/faculty/ckutil/>